Root Causes of Inequities in Birth Outcomes
2019 South Carolina Tri-County Health Symposium
Joia Crear-Perry, MD
Mission
NBEC creates solutions that optimize Black maternal and infant health through training, policy advocacy, research and community centered collaboration.

Vision
All Black mothers and babies thrive.

Core Values:
Leadership, Freedom, Wellness, Black Lives, Sisterhood
NBEC Focus

- Dismantling systems of power and racism
- Assessing and Educating on SDHI
- Provide policy improvements

“Working in this area of overlap is part of the reason why programs like Healthy Start, Case Management, NFP, and Centering experience much of their success.”

– Arthur James, M.D.
Human Rights – The Global Standard

**Article 2.**

Everyone is entitled to all the rights and freedoms set forth in this Declaration, **without distinction of any kind**, such as race, color, sex, language, religion, political or other opinion, national or social origin, property, birth or other status.

**Article 3.**

Everyone has the right to **life**, liberty and security of person

**Article 25.**

(1) Everyone has the right to a **standard of living adequate for the health and well-being of himself and of his family**, including food, clothing, housing and medical care and necessary social services

(2) Motherhood and childhood are **entitled** to special care and assistance. All children, whether born in or out of wedlock, shall enjoy the same protection.
Reproductive Justice

The human right to maintain personal bodily autonomy, have children, not have children, and parent the children we have in safe and sustainable communities.

-Loretta Ross

We must...

• Analyze power systems
• Address intersecting oppressions
• Center the most marginalized
• Join together across issues and identities
birth equity (*noun*): 

1. The assurance of the conditions of optimal births for all people with a willingness to address racial and social inequities in a sustained effort.

Joia Crear-Perry, MD

*National Birth Equity Collaborative*
Root Causes and Social Determinants of Health
Root Causes

- Institutional Racism
- Class Oppression
- Gender Discrimination and Exploitation

Power and Wealth Imbalance

Labor Market

Globalization & Deregulation

TAX Policy

Housing Policy

Education System

Social Safety Net

Social Networks

Social Determinants of Health

- Safe Affordable Housing
- Quality Education
- Social Security
- Safe Affordable Housing

Psychosocial Stress / Unhealthy Behaviors

Disparity in the Distribution of Disease, Illness, and Wellbeing

Adapted by MPHI from R. Hofrichter, *Tackling Health Inequities Through Public Health Practice.*
What are “Social Determinants of Health”?

“The social determinants of health are the conditions in which people are born, grow, live, work, and age.

These circumstances are shaped by the distribution of money, power, and resources at the global, national, and local levels.

Examples of resources include employment, housing, education, health care, public safety, and food access.”

Source: World Health Organization (http://www.who.int/social_determinants/sdh_definition/en/)
Normalizing and Deconstructing Bias
Implicit bias (noun):

1. Bias is the “implicit” ... unconscious activation of prejudice notions (of race, gender, ethnicity, age, etc.) that influences our judgment and decision-making capacity.

Devine, 1989
Implicit Bias

Bias is inherent
  • Unconscious assumptions about an other skew our understanding, unintentionally affecting actions and judgments

Concerted efforts to move forward
  • Reframe implicit bias as an unintentional and unconscious habit
  • This allows us to focus on mindfulness in pursuit of conscious, deliberate behavior change
Reflexive Critical Thinking

Knowing how to question information, identifying and controlling for our personal biases.

- We all think of ourselves as objective and fair when looking at evidence.
- Critical thinking is moot with sexist, racist, or anti-science views.
- Beliefs and values are normative because they’re linked to powerful social institutions, that we trust.
- When you don’t know what information to trust, or you have a weak commitment to new ideas, research shows you don’t take action.
- Some seek out alternative explanations to soothe.
Implicit Association Test (IAT)
• Anthony Greenwald (1998)
• Cannot measure bias by introspection
• Tool measures quickness of responses as association to certain concepts

Patricia Devine and colleagues successfully used the IAT in “Long-term reduction in implicit race bias: A prejudice habit-breaking intervention”
Decreasing Bias

Results
- Does not change racial attitudes or motivations to respond without prejudice
- Participants were more concerned and aware of discrimination and their own personal bias

Strategies
- Stereotype replacement
- Thinking of counter-stereotypic examples
- Individualizing instead of generalizing
- Perspective taking/"Walking in their shoes"
- Increasing opportunities for bias
What Would You Do?
Let’s Talk

How did the video make you feel?

How might bias impact how one person treats another?

How might bias impact how one person responds to another’s wrong-doing?

In what ways does bias occur between systems and a person?
Social Construction of Race
Anthropological Approaches Demonstrate

RACE ≠ ETHNIC GROUP ≠ POPULATION ≠ ANCESTRY

These are four different ways to describe, conceptualize and discuss human variation... and cannot be used interchangeably.
Learning from Social Sciences

**Race** - physical differences that groups and cultures consider socially significant

**Ethnicity** - refers to shared culture, such as language, ancestry, practices, and beliefs.

(American Sociological Association)

- Race is real, and it matters in society, but not how racists think it does.
- Race is not a genetic cluster nor a population.
- Race is not biology, but racism has biological effects.
- Social constructs are real for those who hold them.
The Story of Race
Race - A Social Construct with Deep Implications

African American women who initiated prenatal care in the first trimester still had higher rates of infant mortality than non-Hispanic white women with late or no prenatal care.

WHAT?

Race is not biologically significant.

We socially categorize ourselves and assign rules for interaction based on those groups (class, ethnicity, religion, etc.).

HOW?

The experience of systematic racism—not “race” itself—compromises health.
Racism - Not Race
Levels of Racism

- Personally Mediated
- Internalized
- Institutional
Levels of Racism

**Internalized racism:** These are private beliefs about race that reside inside our minds. (within Individuals)

**Interpersonal racism:** When we bring our private beliefs about race into our interactions with others. (between individuals)

**Institutional racism:** Discriminatory treatment, unfair policies and practices, and inequitable opportunities and impacts, based on race. (within Institutions)

**Structural racism:** Racial bias across institutions and society that systematically privilege white people and disadvantage people of color.

Source: Race Forward
Accelerated telomere shortening in response to life stress

Elissa S. Epel, Elizabeth H. Blackburn, Jue Lin, Firdaus S. Dhabhar, Nancy E. Adler, Jason D. Morrow and Richard M. Cawthon

PNAS December 7, 2004. 101 (49) 17312-17315; https://doi.org/10.1073/pnas.0407162101

58 healthy premenopausal mothers/caregivers of either a healthy child or a chronically ill child.

The more years of caregiving, controlling for mother’s age
1. the shorter the mother's telomere length
2. the lower the telomerase activity
3. the greater the oxidative stress
   • Significant correlations between perceived stress and all three markers of cellular aging across the entire sample of caregivers and noncaregivers
   • Exists across the continuum of normative stress levels, especially notable at the extremes (low and high perceived stress).
Chronic worry about racial discrimination may play an important role in Black-White disparities in preterm birth (PTB).

May help explain the greater PTB disparities among more socioeconomically-advantaged women.

Only measured overt experiences of racial discrimination, but it is likely that findings are similar for different types of racial discrimination (emotional psychological) and PTB.
Combining the “concept of whiteness” - a system that socially, economically and ideologically benefits European descendants - with other research to determine the social factors that influence whites’ health.

- Jennifer Malat, Sarah Mayorga-Gallo, David R. Williams

Whiteness and health:
- Societal conditions
- Individual social characteristics and experiences
- Psychosocial responses
“White”

Social Science & Medicine
Volume 199, February 2018, Pages 148-156

The effects of whiteness on the health of whites in the USA

Jennifer Malat, Sarah Mayorga-Gallo, David R. Williams

Show more

https://doi.org/10.1016/j.socscimed.2017.06.034
Get rights and content
The effects of whiteness on the health of whites in the USA

Fig. 1. Framework describing the relationship between whiteness and health.
Black Infant Mortality

Infant Mortality Rate (Deaths per 1,000 Live Births) by Race/Ethnicity: Non Hispanic Black, 2011-2013 (Linked Files)

SOURCE: Kaiser Family Foundation's State Health Facts.
White Infant Mortality

Infant Mortality Rate (Deaths per 1,000 Live Births) by Race/Ethnicity: Non Hispanic White, 2011-2013 (Linked Files)

SOURCE: Kaiser Family Foundation's State Health Facts.
Black mothers who are college-educated fare worse than women of all other races who never finished high school.

Obese women of all races have better birth outcomes than black women who are of normal weight.

Black women in the wealthiest neighborhoods do worse than white, Hispanic and Asian mothers in the poorest ones.

African American women who initiated prenatal care in the first trimester still had higher rates of infant mortality than non-Hispanic white women with late or no prenatal.
## Non-Clinical Causes of Maternal Mortality

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Level</th>
<th>Contributing Factor</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Community</td>
<td>Access to clinical care (cost, proximity)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Unstable housing</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Lack of, inadequate, transportation options</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Health Facility</td>
<td>Limited experience with obstetric emergencies</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Lack of appropriate personnel or services</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Lack of guiding protocols or tools to help ensure quality care provision</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Patient/Family</td>
<td>Lack of knowledge of warning signs to need to seek care</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Provider</td>
<td>Missed or delayed diagnosis</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Inappropriate or delayed treatment</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>System</td>
<td>Inadequate receipt of care</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Lack of care coordination/management</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Guiding policies of standards not in place</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Policies and Perinatal Health
Racially discriminatory policies have usually sprung from economic, political, and cultural self-interests, self-interests that are constantly changing.

— Ibram X. Kendi, Stamped from the Beginning: The Definitive History of Racist Ideas in America
History of Reproductive Injustice

- Black women’s bodies used as vessels for the institution of slavery in the U.S.
- Experimentation on black female slaves paved the way for modern day gynecology
- Dr. Samuel Cartwright’s Drapetomania facilitated and supported by Tulane University
- Black women forced to care for and breastfeed white babies
- Eugenics and systemic manipulation of Black family planning

Source(s):
Opioid addiction crisis is the most devastating drug epidemic since crack/cocaine
• **Heroin death rates**, which nearly tripled between 2010 and 2013, have reached a scale of mortality unseen since the peak of the HIV/AIDS epidemic two decades ago.
• **Every 19 minutes**, a baby is born dependent on opioids.
• Fetal/Neonatal Abstinence Syndrome is when the newborn experiences withdrawal symptoms.
• Declaring war on using mothers risks stigmatizing effective treatments
• Babies exposed to their mother’s opioid addiction treatment (methadone or buprenorphine/suboxone) still test positive
**Racially Biased Narratives and Policy**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>White Opioid Narrative</th>
<th>Black Crack/Cocaine Narrative</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>White women are America’s sisters and daughters</td>
<td>Illicit drug use among white women at the time was equally prevalent</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Opioids are an “epidemic of despair” for Middle America</td>
<td>Connoted careless Black motherhood in inner-city America</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Considered a disease, not a moral failing</td>
<td>“Crack babies” considered biologically inferior, eventual super-predators, and a longterm burden on fed. Assistance &amp; service programs</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>No conclusions made about prenatal opioid use or future of exposed babies</td>
<td>Pregnant drug users were convicted as killers, drug dealers and child abusers</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Public health response through special funding ($45 Billion) in fed. health care bill that threatened Medicaid (frontline insurance responder)</td>
<td>Mass incarceration of Black mothers through random drug tests, leveraging child removal and incarceration</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Southern states that led in criminalizing black women are softening punitive polices for addicted mothers</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Lessons Learned from Substance Abuse

Dr. Claire Cole debunked the “crack baby” term with scientific data, determining effects of poverty are a bigger driver of poor longterm developmental outcomes than drug abuse itself.

Understanding community context and humanizing the victims of drug addiction allowed for...

- “Fetal/Neonatal Abstinence Syndrome” recognized over “Crack Babies”
- Aid funding instead of increased criminal justice budgets
Redlining is the practice of arbitrarily denying or limiting financial services to specific neighborhoods, generally because its residents are people of color or are poor.

Banks used the concept to deny loans to homeowners and would-be homeowners who lived in these neighborhoods. This in turn resulted in neighborhood economic decline and the withholding of services or their provision at an exceptionally high cost.
Race-The House We Live In

The House You Live In
Columbia, SC

Areas by Grade

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Area</th>
<th>Grade</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>9%</td>
<td>A &quot;Best&quot;</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>20%</td>
<td>B &quot;Still Desirable&quot;</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>30%</td>
<td>C &quot;Definitely Declining&quot;</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>41%</td>
<td>D &quot;Hazardous&quot;</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Demographics

71,275 Total Population (1940)
55.7% Native-born white
31.1% African American
0.7% Foreign-born white

Area Descriptions
Driving factors for IMR disparity:

- Racial residential segregation
- Black political empowerment
- Black and white poverty

Analysis of Black political power and IM in all U.S. central cities with a population of at least 50,000 residents, 10% of whom are black.

- Absolute political power, which does not influence Black infant mortality
- Relative political power, which influences Black infant mortality.
- Black political power had no significant effect on white postneonatal mortality.

Milbank Q. 1993;71(1):41-64.

Segregation, poverty, and empowerment: health consequences for African Americans.

Laveist TA."
Opportunities
Going Upstream

Social Structure
Power and Wealth Imbalance
Social Determinants of Health
Psychosocial Stress
Unhealthy Behaviors
Individual Disease State
Causes of Inequities

Non-Clinical Causes of Inequities

• Racism and obstetric violence
• Housing
• Income
• Neighborhood safety
• Air quality and environmental stresses
• Food Insecurity
• Access to quality, comprehensive health care services
• Low educational attainment
• Unemployment and rigid scheduling

SC Wins

Supporting the CenteringPregnancy® model

Health Start- HRSA funded!

Community based and community-serving

Locations

• Pee Dee Healthy Start, Inc. (legacy)
• Palmetto Health
• South Carolina Office of Rural Health
Medicaid Policies for Birth Equity

Long Acting Reversible Contraceptives (LARC)
- LARC insertion reimbursement- fully covered to the hospitals outside the DRG, including sales tax.

*SC is the first state in the nation to enact such a policy.

Centreing Pregnancy
- SCDHHS, BCBSSC and South Carolina State Health Plan all reimburse physicians for Centreing Pregnancy.

Screening, Brief Intervention and Referral to Treatment (SBIRT)
2012
- SCDHHS, BCBSSC and South Carolina State Health Plan providers are reimbursed once per fiscal year for screenings and twice per fiscal year for brief interventions for each patient receiving these services.

Early Elective Deliveries (EEDs)
2013
- SCDHHS and BlueCross BlueShield of South Carolina (BCBSSC) stopped reimbursement to hospitals and physicians for elective inductions or non-medically indicated deliveries before 39 weeks gestational age.

*SC the first state in the nation in which the Medicaid agency and a commercial insurer joined forces to establish a policy of nonpayment.

(Healthy Connections Medicaid)
Admin and Grasstops for Birth Equity

2012
SCBOI collaborated with ChooseWell to create a LARC toolkit
Hosts webinars and presentations at meetings and the annual symposium

Screening, Brief Intervention and Referral to Treatment (SBIRT)

2012
• SCDHHS, with the support of SCBOI, began incentivizing doctors to screen pregnant women for
  – substance abuse
  – domestic violence
  – depression

Supporting Vaginal Birth Initiative
Grasstips to Grassroots

• 19 Physicians practices offer CenteringPregnancy
• The Mother’s Milk Bank of South Carolina received over 60,000 ounces of human milk donations in its first year (2015)

• Amplify lived experience
  – Mothers Voices

• Advocacy for systems and policy change
  – Rural health access and work force
  – Living wage
  – Paid family/sick leave
  – Education quality and access
  – Environmental justice
Defining Community

Community

1: a unified body of individuals: such as
a: the people with common interests living in a particular area broadly: the area itself, the problems of a large community
b: a group of people with a common characteristic or interest living together within a larger society, a community of retired persons
c: a body of persons of common and especially professional interests scattered through a larger society, the academic community
d: a body of persons or nations having a common history or common social, economic, and political interests, the international community
e: a group linked by a common policy

Community Based Organization

A public or private nonprofit organization that is representative of a community or a significant segment of a community and works to meet needs and improve life for residents. They build grassroots power & equity across society through intersecting issues.

Identifying CBOs
- Created from need
- Start-up culture
- Irregularly funded or social entrepreneurship model
- Focus and programming meets immediate needs of community
Campaign for Black Babies

Cities with highest black infant deaths
*1 in 4 black infant deaths occur in these places.

Cities with active campaigns for black babies
*Meeting our 5-year and 10-year goals in all 20 places means saving 3,000+ babies.

“Look at the Whole Me”: A Mixed-Methods Examination of Black Infant Mortality in the US through Women’s Lived Experiences and Community Context

Maeve E. Wallace 1,2,*, Carmen Green 2, Lisa Richardson 2,3, Katherine Theall 1,2 and Joia Crear-Perry 2
Birth Equity Index

Data tool to identify significant social determinants

- A comprehensive set (50+) of social determinant indicators were selected to broadly define health and opportunities for better health within the social and physical environment of 20 US metro areas with some of the highest black infant mortality rates in the country. We identified those that were at least marginally associated with black infant mortality rates including:
  - prevalence of smoking and obesity among adult residents
  - number of poor physical and mental health days experienced by residents
  - percentage of residents with limited access to healthy foods
  - rates of homicide and jail admissions
  - air pollution
  - racial residential segregation (isolation)
  - rates of unemployment and low education among NH black residents
  - income inequality between black and white households

- We used data-reduction techniques to combine values of these indicators into an overall index of black infant mortality social determinants, with higher values representing worse health conditions.
### Data: Z Codes

#### Z59
- Z59.1, Inadequate housing
- Z59.2, Discord with neighbors, lodgers and landlord
- Z59.3, Problems related to living in residential institution
- Z59.4, Lack of adequate food and safe drinking water
- Z59.5, Extreme poverty
- Z59.6, Low income
- Z59.7, Insufficient social insurance and welfare support
- Z59.8, Other problems related to housing and economic circumstances
- Z59.9, Problem related to housing and economic circumstances, unspecified

#### Z60
- Z60.0, Problems of adjustment to life-cycle transitions
- Z60.2, Problems related to living alone
- Z60.3, Acculturation difficulty
- Z60.4, Social exclusion and rejection
- Z60.5, Target of (perceived) adverse discrimination and persecution

#### Z65
- **Problems related to other psychosocial circumstances**
  - Z65.0, Conviction in civil and criminal proceedings without imprisonment
  - Z65.1, Imprisonment and other incarceration
  - Z65.2, Problems related to release from prison
  - Z65.3, Problems related to other legal circumstances
  - Z65.4, Victim of crime and terrorism
  - Z65.5, Exposure to disaster, war and other hostilities
  - Z65.8, Other specified problems related to psychosocial circumstances
  - Z65.9, Problem related to unspecified psychosocial circumstances

#### Z72
- **Problems related to lifestyle**
  - Z72.0, Tobacco use
  - Z72.1, Alcohol use and binge drinking
  - Z72.2, Narco-synthesis
  - Z72.3, Lack of physical exercise
  - Z72.4, Inappropriate diet and eating habits
  - Z72.5, High risk sexual behavior
    - Z72.51, High risk heterosexual behavior
    - Z72.52, High risk homosexual behavior
    - Z72.53, High risk bisexual behavior
  - Z72.6, Gambling and betting
  - Z72.8, Other problems related to lifestyle

#### Z73
- **Problems related to behavior pattern**
  - Z73.1, Type A behavior pattern
  - Z73.2, Lack of relaxation and leisure
  - Z73.3, Stress, not elsewhere classified
  - Z73.4, Inadequate social skills, not elsewhere classified
  - Z73.5, Social role conflict, not elsewhere classified
  - Z73.6, Limitation of activities due to disability
  - Z73.8, Other problems related to life management difficulty
    - Z73.81, Behavioral insomnia of childhood
      - Z73.810, Behavioral insomnia of childhood, sleep-onset association type
      - Z73.811, Behavioral insomnia of childhood, limit setting type
      - Z73.812, Behavioral insomnia of childhood, combined type
      - Z73.819, Behavioral insomnia of childhood, unspecified
    - Z73.82, Dual sensory impairment
    - Z73.89, Other problems related to life management difficulty
    - Z73.9, Problem related to life management difficulty, unspecified

#### Z75
- **Problems related to medical**
  - Z75.3, Unavailability and inaccessibility of health-care facilities
  - Z75.4, Unavailability and inaccessibility of other helping agencies
**BACKGROUND**

Women in the US are dying in pregnancy and childbirth at unprecedented rates.

The community closest to the pain and suffering through disparate deaths and complications are Black mothers and birthing people.

Disrupting birthing narratives and care required cultural shifting from mother/individual blame to provider/systems accountability.

Cultural transformation depends on the capacity for providers and systems to listen to, understand, and respond to community voices in sharing stories of disrespectful and dismissive care and service gaps.

**PURPOSE**

To develop and apply a community informed theoretical model in the creation and testing of a participatory patient-reported experience metric (PREM) of mistreatment and discrimination in childbirth.

There is no metric for patient-reported experience of mistreatment and discrimination in childbirth and pregnancy developed by, for, and with impacted Black communities, mothers, and scholars.

**OBJECTIVES**

- Facilitate and sustain opportunities for Black mothers' stories to be valued, seen, & heard in semi-structured focus group interviews
- Develop a community informed theoretical model in collaboration with Black mothers/birthing people based on group interviews
- Map existing theoretical constructs onto those identified from Black mothers and CBOs to inform the co-creation and co-testing of a PREM of respect, mistreatment, and discrimination
- Utilize the PREM in systems accountability, quality improvement patient advocacy and interprofessional education
## IHI (Institute for Healthcare Improvement) Framework To Achieve Health Equity

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Step</th>
<th>Description</th>
<th>Strategies</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>
| 1. Make health equity a strategic priority | • Demonstrate leadership commitment to improving equity at all levels of the organization  
• Secure sustainable funding through new payment models |
| 2. Develop structure & processes to support health equity work | • Establish a governance committee to oversee and manage equity work across the organization  
• Dedicate resources in the budget to support equity work |
| 3. Deploy specific strategies to address the multiple determinants of health on which health care organizations can have a direct impact | • Health care services (CLAS, CHW, co-design processes)  
• Socioeconomic status (fair pay & opportunity for employees)  
• Physical environment  
• Healthy behaviors |
| 4. Decrease institutional racism within the organization | • Physical space: Buildings & design  
• Health insurance plans accepted by the organization  
• Reduce implicit bias within organization policies, structures & in patient care |
| 5. Develop partnerships with community organizations | • Leverage community assets to work together on community issues related to improving health & equity |

The health care system alone isn’t equipped to overcome the inequities driven by income, language, education or racism

**Racial Equity Lens**
- Centers place, environment and social determinants
- Addresses aggravated risk for specific local challenges
- Addresses intergenerational and cumulative effects of structural racism on health
Useful Resources

Racial Equity Analysis
- What?
- Why care?
- Now what?

Root Cause Analysis
• Identify systems vulnerabilities that impact patient safety and outcomes
• Identify measurable systems-based corrective actions
• Ensure follow-through and implementation
• Ensure that leadership at all levels of the organization participate and hold staff accountable for RCAs

5 Whys Exercise
❖ Identify an event or pattern that concerns staff
❖ Identify tangible and intangible structures that are contributing to results
❖ Brainstorm implications for action

How can you better apply existing tools in your daily work?
Thank you

Founder President

drjoia@birthequity.org

facebook, Instagram, Twitter @birthequity